

1. After the realization of the shock, the Ht's problem is:

$$\max_{C_t} \sum_{t=0}^{\infty} \beta^t u(C_t, B_t)$$

s.t.

$$p_t C_t \leq M_{t+1} + T_0 \quad (\mu_0) \\ p_t C_t \leq M_{t+1} + \bar{B}_t, \quad \forall t \geq 1 \quad (\mu_t)$$

$$M_t + B_t \leq M_{t+1} + \bar{T}_t - p_t c_t + \omega_t w_t + p_{t-1} B_{t-1} + \bar{B}_t \\ M_t B_0 \leq M_{t+1} + \bar{T}_0 - p_0 c_0 + \omega_0 w_0 \quad (\mu_0 + T_0)$$

$$C_t = M_t w_t + \lambda_0 p_0 \quad \text{Mo: } \lambda_0 = \mu_1 + \lambda_1$$

$$c_t: \mu_t u(c_t) = \mu_{t+1} u_t + \lambda_1 \quad M_t: M_t = \mu_{t+1} + \lambda_{t+1}, \quad t \geq 1$$

$$\lambda_0: \lambda_0 w_0 = -\lambda_0 w_0$$

$$B_t: \lambda_0 = \lambda_0 \lambda_1 \\ B_t: \mu_t c_t = -\lambda_t w_t, \quad t \geq 1 \quad B_t: M_t = R_t + \lambda_{t+1}, \quad t \geq 1$$

From period 1, the economy is stationary

$$\Rightarrow \beta = \frac{\lambda_t}{\lambda_{t+1}} = \frac{1}{R_{t+1}} \Rightarrow R_{t+1} = \frac{1}{\beta}, \quad \forall t \geq 1 \Rightarrow R_t = \frac{1}{\beta}, \quad \forall t \geq 0$$

$$\text{and } \beta \cdot \frac{w_{t+1}}{w_t} = \frac{1}{\lambda_{t+1}} \cdot \frac{p_t}{p_{t+1}}, \quad \frac{\beta \cdot w_{t+1}}{w_t} = \frac{\lambda_t}{\lambda_{t+1}} \cdot \frac{w_t}{w_0} = \beta \frac{w_t}{w_0}$$

$$\Rightarrow \frac{w_{t+1}}{w_t} = \frac{w^*}{w_0}, \quad \text{if we assume } u = \log c + \gamma \log (w - \lambda_t)$$

$$\Rightarrow \frac{1 - \lambda_0}{1 - \lambda^*} = \frac{w^*}{w_0} \Rightarrow (1 - \lambda_0) w_0 = w^* (1 - \lambda^*)$$

$$\text{and } \frac{C_0}{1 - \lambda_0} = \frac{1}{1 - \frac{w_0}{w_0}} \cdot \frac{w_0}{P_0}$$

$$\frac{\beta \cdot w_{t+1}}{w_t} = \beta \cdot \frac{c_0}{c^*} = \frac{\beta + 1}{\mu_0 + \lambda_0} \cdot \frac{1}{P_0}$$

$$\Rightarrow \beta \frac{c_0}{c^*} = \frac{c_0}{1 - \lambda_0} \cdot \frac{P_0}{w_0} \cdot \frac{p^*}{P_0} = \frac{c_0}{1 - \lambda_0} \frac{p^*}{w_0}$$

$$\Rightarrow \frac{\beta}{c^*} = \frac{p^*}{(1 - \lambda_0) w_0}$$

Assumption: ~~U(c, e)~~ is homothetic in (c, e) .

Taking $\{\bar{P}_t, \bar{w}_t\}$ as given, $\bar{c}_0 = \frac{M_1 + T_0}{M_{-1}} c_0$, $\bar{e}_0 = \frac{M_1 + T_0}{M_{-1}} e_0$
 Solve the problem when there is a positive shock
 of c_0 , e_0 solve the problem when there is no
 positive shock.

$$\Rightarrow \bar{d}_0 > \underline{d}_0, \quad \bar{c}_0 > c_0 \Leftrightarrow \bar{y}_0 > y_0$$

$$\begin{aligned} \text{Since } (1 - \bar{e}_0) \bar{w}_0 &= \bar{w}^* (1 - \bar{d}_0) \\ \{ \bar{u} - \bar{e}_0 \} \bar{w}_0 &= \bar{w}^* (1 - \bar{d}_0) \end{aligned} \Rightarrow \bar{w}_0 > w_0.$$

For sticky producers, the price is determined at period -1 , so the price \bar{P}_0, P_0 are:

$$\bar{P}_0 = \int d_i \left(\frac{\bar{w}_0}{\bar{e}_0} \right)^{\frac{\alpha}{\alpha-1}} + \int d_i \left(\frac{\bar{w}_0}{\bar{e}_0} \right)^{\frac{\alpha}{\alpha-1}}$$

$$P_0 = \int d_i \left(\frac{w_0}{e_0} \right)^{\frac{\alpha}{\alpha-1}} + \int d_i \left(\frac{w_0}{e_0} \right)^{\frac{\alpha}{\alpha-1}}$$

$$\Rightarrow \text{when } \bar{w}_0 > w_0 \Rightarrow \bar{P}_0 > P_0$$

$$\text{and } \frac{\bar{P}_0}{w_0} = \left[\alpha \cdot 0^{\frac{\alpha}{1-\alpha}} + \int d_i \left(\frac{\bar{w}_0}{\bar{e}_0} \right)^{\frac{\alpha}{\alpha-1}} \alpha i! \right]^{\frac{\alpha-1}{\alpha}}$$

$$\frac{P_0}{w_0} = \left[\alpha \cdot 0^{\frac{\alpha}{1-\alpha}} + \int d_i \left(\frac{w_0}{e_0} \right)^{\frac{\alpha}{\alpha-1}} \alpha i! \right]^{\frac{\alpha-1}{\alpha}}$$

$$\Rightarrow \text{when } \bar{w}_0 > w_0 \Rightarrow \frac{w_0}{\bar{P}_0} > \frac{w_0}{P_0}$$

$$\Rightarrow \bar{y}_0 > y_0; \quad \bar{P}_0 > P_0; \quad \frac{w_0}{\bar{P}_0} > \frac{w_0}{P_0}.$$

HW 6

Macroeconomics

Problem 2:

$$C_t + K_{t+1} = f(C_t) + (1-\delta)K_t$$

$$U'(C_t) = \beta U''(C_{t+1}) (f'(K_t) + 1 - \delta)$$

Log-linearize:

$$C \hat{C}_t + K \hat{K}_{t+1} = f'(K) K \hat{K}_t + (1-\delta) K \hat{K}_t \quad \textcircled{1}$$

$$\begin{aligned} U''(C) C \hat{C}_t &= \beta U''(C) C \hat{C}_{t+1} (f'(K) + 1 - \delta) + \\ &\quad (\beta U'(C) f''(K)) K \hat{K}_{t+1} \end{aligned} \quad \textcircled{2}$$

Steady state relationship:

$$C + K = f(K) + (1-\delta)K \Rightarrow C + \delta K = f(K) \quad \textcircled{3}$$

$$U'(C) = \beta U'(C) (f'(K) + 1 - \delta) \Rightarrow \beta (f'(K) + (1-\delta)) = 1 \quad \textcircled{4}$$

$$\textcircled{4} \Rightarrow f'(K) = \frac{1}{\beta} + \delta - 1 \quad K = f'^{-1}\left(\frac{1}{\beta} + \delta - 1\right)$$

$$\textcircled{3} \Rightarrow C = f\left(f'^{-1}\left(\frac{1}{\beta} + \delta - 1\right)\right) - \delta f'^{-1}\left(\frac{1}{\beta} + \delta - 1\right)$$

$$\text{Then } \textcircled{1} \Rightarrow \hat{K}_{t+1} = \frac{1}{\beta} \hat{K}_t - \frac{C}{K} \hat{C}_t$$

$$\textcircled{2} \Rightarrow \hat{C}_{t+1} + \frac{\beta U'(C) f''(K) K}{U''(C) C} \hat{K}_{t+1} = \hat{C}_t$$

$$\begin{pmatrix} \frac{\beta U'(C) f''(K) K}{U''(C) C} & 1 \\ 1 & 0 \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} \hat{C}_{t+1} \\ \hat{K}_{t+1} \end{pmatrix} = \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 0 \\ -\frac{C}{K} & \frac{1}{\beta} \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} \hat{C}_t \\ \hat{K}_t \end{pmatrix}$$

$$\Rightarrow \begin{pmatrix} \hat{c}_{t+1} \\ \hat{\beta}_{t+1} \end{pmatrix} = \begin{pmatrix} 1 & \frac{\beta u'(c)f''(K)K}{u''(c)c} \\ 0 & 1 \end{pmatrix}^{-1} \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 0 \\ -\frac{c}{K} & \frac{1}{\beta} \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} \hat{c}_t \\ \hat{\beta}_t \end{pmatrix}$$

$$= \begin{pmatrix} 1 & -\frac{\beta u'(c)f''(K)K}{u''(c)c} \\ 0 & 1 \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 0 \\ -\frac{c}{K} & \frac{1}{\beta} \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} \hat{c}_t \\ \hat{\beta}_t \end{pmatrix}$$

$$= \begin{pmatrix} 1 + \frac{\beta u'(c)f''(K)}{u''(c)c} & -\frac{u'(c)f''(K)K}{u''(c)c} \\ 0 & 1 \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} \hat{c}_t \\ \hat{\beta}_t \end{pmatrix}$$

$$= \begin{pmatrix} 1 & -\frac{c}{K} \\ 0 & \frac{1}{\beta} \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} \hat{c}_t \\ \hat{\beta}_t \end{pmatrix}$$

$$\triangleq A \begin{pmatrix} \hat{c}_t \\ \hat{\beta}_t \end{pmatrix}$$

$$\det(A - \lambda I) = 0 \Rightarrow$$

$$(1 + \frac{\beta u'(c)f''(K)}{u''(c)}) - \lambda)(\frac{1}{\beta} - \lambda) - \frac{u'(c)f''(K)}{u''(c)} = 0$$

$$\Rightarrow \lambda^2 - (\frac{1}{\beta} + \beta g + 1)\lambda + \frac{1}{\beta} = 0, \\ \text{where } g = \frac{u'(c)f''(K)}{u''(c)} > 0.$$

$$\left. \begin{array}{l} \lambda_1 + \lambda_2 = \frac{1}{\beta} + \beta g + 1 > 2 \\ \lambda_1 \cdot \lambda_2 = \frac{1}{\beta} > 1 \\ (\lambda_1 - 1)(\lambda_2 - 1) = \lambda_1 \lambda_2 + 1 - (\lambda_1 + \lambda_2) = -\beta g < 0 \end{array} \right\} \Rightarrow \begin{array}{l} \lambda_1, \lambda_2 > 1 \\ \text{One} > 1 \\ 0 < \text{the other} \end{array}$$

The root $\in (0, 1)$ is converging; the other root > 1 is NOT.

• HH's problem:

more $\sum_{t=1}^T \pi_t(c_t)$ less $\pi_t(c_t)$ more $\pi_t(c_{t+1})$.

$$\text{S.t. } \pi_t(c_t) c_t(c_t) \leq M_t(c_t) \quad \text{and} \quad \pi_t(c_t)$$

$$\begin{aligned} M_t(c_t) + B_t(c_t) &\leq M_{t+1}(c_{t+1}) - \pi_{t+1}(c_{t+1}) C_{t+1}(c_{t+1}) \\ &+ R_{t+1}(c_{t+1}) B_{t+1}(c_{t+1}) + \pi_{t+1}(c_t) \\ &+ \pi_t(c_t) \pi_t(c_{t+1}) + T_t. \quad (\text{use } \pi_t(c_t)) \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} \text{F.o.C: } c_t(c_t): \quad &\pi_t \pi_t(c_t) \pi_t(c_{t+1}), \pi_t(c_t) = \pi_t(c_t) (\pi_t(c_t) + \sum_{s=t+1}^{\infty} \mu_s(c_t)) \\ c_t(c_t): \quad &\pi_t \pi_t(c_t) \pi_t(c_{t+1}), \pi_t(c_t) = -\sum_{s=t+1}^{\infty} \mu_s(c_t) \pi_t(c_t) \\ M_t(c_t): \quad &M_t(c_t) = \pi_t(c_t) + \sum_{s=t+1}^{\infty} \mu_s(c_t) \end{aligned}$$

$$\pi_t(c_t): \quad M_t(c_t) = R_t(c_t) \sum_{s=t+1}^{\infty} \mu_s(c_t).$$

$$\Rightarrow -\frac{\pi_t(c_t)}{\pi_t(c_t)} = \frac{\pi_t(c_t)}{R_t(c_t)} \frac{\sum_{s=t+1}^{\infty} \mu_s(c_t)}{\pi_t(c_t) + \sum_{s=t+1}^{\infty} \mu_s(c_t)} = \frac{\mu_t(c_t)}{R_t(c_t)} \frac{1}{\pi_t(c_t)} \quad ①$$

$$\frac{\pi_t \pi_{t+1}(c_{t+1}) \pi_t(c_{t+1})}{\pi_t \pi_t(c_t) \pi_t(c_{t+1})} = \frac{\pi_{t+1}(c_{t+1})}{\pi_t(c_t)} \cdot \frac{\mu_{t+1}(c_{t+1})}{\mu_t(c_t)}.$$

$$\Rightarrow \beta \frac{\pi_{t+1}(c_{t+1}) \pi_t(c_{t+1})}{\pi_t \pi_t(c_t) \pi_t(c_{t+1})} = \frac{\pi_{t+1}(c_{t+1})}{\pi_t(c_t)} \cdot \frac{\mu_{t+1}(c_{t+1})}{\mu_t(c_t)} \\ \Rightarrow \sum_{s=t+1}^{\infty} \pi_{t+1}(c_{t+1}) \pi_t(c_{t+1}) \beta \frac{\pi_t(c_{t+1})}{\pi_t(c_t)} = \frac{1}{\mu_t(c_t)}. \\ \Rightarrow \sum_{s=t+1}^{\infty} \pi_{t+1}(c_{t+1}) \pi_t(c_{t+1}) \beta \frac{\pi_t(c_{t+1})}{\pi_t(c_t)} \frac{R_t(c_t)}{\pi_t(c_{t+1})} = 1. \quad ②.$$

~~different goods producer:~~

F in 91.

$$\text{more } \int_{t=1}^T \pi_t(c_t) y_t(c_t) - \int_{t=1}^T \int_{s=t+1}^{\infty} \pi_t(c_t) y_t(c_t, s) y_t(c_t, s+1) d s + \int_{t=1}^T \int_{s=t+1}^{\infty} \int_{r=s+1}^{\infty} \pi_t(c_t) y_t(c_t, s) y_t(c_t, s+1) y_t(c_t, r) d r d s d r \\ y_t(c_t, s) y_t(c_t, s+1) = \left(\int_0^s y_t(c_i, c_t) d c_i + \int_0^s y_t^*(c_i, c_t) d c_i' \right)^{-1} \frac{1}{\sigma}.$$

$$\Rightarrow p_t(c_t) \frac{1}{\theta} y(c_t)^{1-\theta} \cdot \theta y^t(c_t)^{\theta-1} = p_t^t(c_t, c_t).$$

$$\Rightarrow y^t(c_t, c_t) = \left[\frac{p_t(c_t, c_t)}{p_t(c_t)} \right]^{\frac{1}{\theta-1}} \cdot y_t(c_t)$$

$$\text{smi. only, } y^s(c_t, c_t) = \left(\frac{p_s(c_t, c_t)}{p_t(c_t)} \right)^{\frac{1}{\theta-1}} y_t(c_t).$$

flexible intermediate goods producer:

$$\max_{\alpha} (p_t(c_t) - w_t(c_t)) p_t(c_t, c_t)^{\frac{1}{\theta-1}} \cdot y_t(c_t) \cdot p_t(c_t, c_t)^{\frac{1}{1-\alpha}}.$$

$$\Rightarrow p_t(c_t, c_t) = \frac{w_t(c_t)}{\alpha}.$$

sticky intermediate goods producer:

$$\max_{p_s(c_t)} \sum_{s \neq t} Q_{st}(c_t) | p_s^s(c_t, c_t) - w_{st}(c_t) |^{\frac{1}{\theta-1}} \frac{y_{st}}{p_s(c_t)}$$

$$\Rightarrow p_s^s(c_t, c_t) = \frac{1}{\theta} \sum_{s \neq t} Q_{st}(c_t) | p_{st}(c_t) |^{\frac{1}{\theta-1}} w_{st}(c_t) | p_{st}(c_t) |^{\frac{1}{1-\theta}} y_{st}(c_t).$$

$$\text{and } Q_{st}(c_t) = p_{st}(c_t) | c_t | \frac{w_{st}(c_t)}{w_c(c_t)} - \frac{p_t(c_t)}{p_{st}(c_t)}.$$

Market clearing: goods: $c_t(c_t) = y_t(c_t)$.

$$\text{labor: } \rho_{st}(c_t) = \left\{ \alpha \left[\frac{p_t(c_t)}{p_{st}(c_t)} \right]^{\frac{1}{\theta-1}} + (1-\alpha) \left(\frac{p_s^s(c_t, c_t)}{p_{st}(c_t)} \right)^{\frac{1}{\theta-1}} \right\} y_{st}.$$

Let linearize the system:

$$\text{First: } p_t(c_t) \frac{\alpha}{\theta-1} = \alpha p_t(c_t) \frac{\alpha}{\theta-1} + (1-\alpha) p_s(c_t, s_{t+1}) \frac{\alpha}{\theta-1}$$

by linearizing this, we have:

$$p_t^* \frac{\alpha}{\theta-1} (1 + \lambda p_t) = \alpha p_t^* \frac{\alpha}{\theta-1} (1 + \lambda p_t) + (1-\alpha) p_s^* \frac{\alpha}{\theta-1} (1 + \lambda p_s)$$

In steady state, we have $p_t^* = p_{st}^* = p_s^*$

$$\Rightarrow \lambda = \frac{\frac{\alpha}{\theta-1} p_t^* \frac{\alpha}{\theta-1} - 1}{p_t^* \frac{\alpha}{\theta-1}} = \frac{\alpha}{\theta-1} = \lambda_1 = \lambda_2$$

$$\Rightarrow p_t = \alpha p_t + (1-\alpha) p_{st}.$$

moreover, by labor market clearing:

$$l_t(c_t) = l_t(p_t(c_t), g_t) \frac{\theta}{\theta-1} + (1-\alpha) p_s(c_t, s_{t+1}) \frac{\theta}{\theta-1} p_{st} \rightarrow \text{linearizing this, we have:}$$

$$l_t^*(l_t) = \left[\alpha p_t^* \frac{\theta}{\theta-1} (1 + \mu p_t) + (1-\alpha) p_s^* \frac{\theta}{\theta-1} (1 + \mu p_s) \right] p_t^* \frac{\theta}{\theta-1} (1 - \mu p_t) \frac{\theta}{\theta-1} (1 + \mu p_s) \\ \text{in steady state, } l_t^* = g_t^*, \quad p_t^* = p_s^*.$$

$$+ l_t = (1 + \mu(\alpha p_t + (1-\alpha) p_{st})) (1 - \mu p_t) (1 + \mu p_s) \\ = 1 + g_t \Rightarrow l_t = g_t.$$

$$\text{and } g_t(c_t) = c_t c_t(g_t) \Rightarrow g_t(c_t) = c_t^* (c_t + 1) \rightarrow g_t = c_t = l_t \\ \text{now, do linearization of the system:}$$

From intertemporal Euler equation we have:

$$\beta \tilde{l}_t \frac{u(c_{t+1})}{m(c_t)} \frac{p_t(c_t)}{p_t(c_{t+1})} \frac{p_{st}(c_t)}{p_{st}(c_{t+1})} = 1$$

$$\Rightarrow \beta E_t \frac{u(c^*, \sigma)}{u(c^{t+1}, \sigma)} (1 + \eta_1 c_{t+1} \eta_2 \rho_{\text{end}}) = \frac{p_{t+1}^*}{p_t^*} (1 + p_t) (1 + p_{t+1}) R^* \alpha t$$

and in steady state $\Rightarrow \beta \frac{p_t^*}{p_{t+1}^*} R^* = 1$

$$\Rightarrow \bar{L}_t (1 + \eta_1 + \eta_2) (c_{t+1} - c_t) (1 + p_t - p_{t+1}) (1 + r_t) = 1$$

By $c_t = \delta c_t$.

$$\Rightarrow \bar{E}_t (\eta_1 + \eta_2) (c_{t+1} - c_t) + p_t - p_{t+1} + r_t = 0.$$

$$\Rightarrow c_t = \bar{E}_t c_{t+1} + \frac{1}{\eta_1 + \eta_2} (r_t - \bar{E}_t \pi_{t+1}), \quad \pi_{t+1} = p_{t+1} - p_t.$$

$$\Rightarrow c_t = \bar{E}_t c_{t+1} - \left(\frac{-1}{\eta_1 + \eta_2} \right) (r_t - \bar{E}_t \pi_{t+1}). \quad (1).$$

$$\text{define } \eta' = \frac{1}{\eta_1 + \eta_2} \quad \text{and} \quad \eta_1 = \frac{u(c^*, \sigma)}{u(c^*, \sigma)}, \quad \eta_2 = \frac{u(c^*, \sigma)}{u(c^*, \sigma)}$$

From cash-in-govtance constraint:

$$p_t c_t / c_t (g_t) = M_t (g_t).$$

$$\Rightarrow \frac{p_t^*}{p_{t+1}^*} (1 + p_t - p_{t+1}) (1 + c_t - c_{t+1}) \frac{c^*}{c^*} = \frac{M_t^*}{M_{t+1}^*} (1 + M_t - M_{t+1})$$

$$\text{in steady state, } \frac{p_t^*}{p_{t+1}^*} = \frac{M_t^*}{M_{t+1}^*}$$

$$\Rightarrow M_{t+1} = M_t - M_t (1 + \eta_1 - \eta_2) = \pi_{t+1} + \eta_{t+1} - \eta_t$$

$$\Rightarrow \pi_{t+1} = \pi_t - (\eta_t - \eta_{t+1}) \quad (2)$$

Flexible intermediate goods producer's price is

$$p_{ft}(g_t) = \frac{w_t c(g_t)}{\sigma} \Rightarrow p_{ft}^* (1 + p_{ft}) = \frac{w_t^*}{\sigma} (1 + w_t)$$

$$\Rightarrow p_{ft} = w_t.$$

if we impose tax on labor, s.t. $\bar{w}_t(g_t) = \frac{w_t(g_t)}{\theta}$.

$$\Rightarrow -\frac{w_t(g_t)}{w_t(g_t)} = \frac{w_t(g_t)}{p_t(g_t)}, \frac{1}{\theta} = \frac{p_t(g_t)}{p_t(g_t)}.$$

$$\Rightarrow -\frac{w_t(c^*, \bar{c}^*)}{w_t(c^*, c^*)} \left(1 + \eta_1 c_{t+1} + \eta_2 \bar{c}_{t+1} \right) \frac{(1 - \eta_3 \bar{c}_t - \eta_4 c_t)}{w_t(c^*, c_t)}$$

$$\text{where } \eta_1 = \frac{w_t(c^*, \bar{c}^*)}{w_t(c^*, c^*)}, \quad \eta_2 = \frac{w_t(c^*, \bar{c}^*)}{w_t(c^*, c_t)}, \quad = \frac{p_t(g_t)}{p_t(g_t)} \left(1 + \eta_3 \bar{c}_t + \eta_4 c_t \right)$$

$$\eta_3 = \frac{w_t(c^*, \bar{c}^*)}{w_t(c^*, c^*)}, \quad \eta_4 = \frac{w_t(c^*, \bar{c}^*)}{w_t(c^*, c_t)}$$

$$\text{in ss, } -\frac{w_t(c^*, c^*)}{w_t(c^*, c_t)} = \frac{p_t^*}{p_t^*}$$

$$\Rightarrow 1 + (\eta_1 - \eta_3) c_t + (\eta_2 - \eta_4) \bar{c}_t + p_t^* = p_t^* + 1$$

$$\Rightarrow p_t^* = (\eta_1 + \eta_2 - \eta_3 - \eta_4) c_t + p_t = \eta_1 + \eta_2 - \eta_3 - \eta_4 + p_t. \quad (3)$$

$$\text{define } \eta_1 + \eta_2 - \eta_3 - \eta_4 = \delta.$$

sticky intermediate goods producer:

$$\sum_{s \neq t} Q_{t+1}(s|t) P_{t+1}(g_{t+1}) \frac{1}{1 - \theta} g_{t+1}(g_{t+1}) \frac{w_{t+1}(g_{t+1})}{w_t(g_t)} = P_g(t, g_t).$$

$$= \frac{\sum_{s \neq t} Q_{t+1}(s|t) P_{t+1}(g_{t+1}) \frac{1}{1 - \theta} g_{t+1}(g_{t+1})}{\sum_{s \neq t} Q_{t+1}(s|t) \frac{w_{t+1}(g_{t+1})}{w_t(g_t)} P_{t+1}(g_{t+1}) \frac{1}{1 - \theta} g_{t+1}(g_{t+1})} \frac{1}{\theta}$$

$$(\mu P_{s|t}) P_{s|t}(g_t) = \frac{w_t^*}{\theta} \frac{w_t(g_t)}{w_t(g_t)} P_{t+1}(g_{t+1}) / \frac{1}{1 - \theta} g_{t+1}(g_{t+1}).$$

By log-linearization, we have

$$(\mu P_{s|t}) P_{s|t}(g_t) = \frac{w_t^*}{\theta} \frac{\sum_{s \neq t} \bar{T}_{t+1}(s|t) \bar{C}_{t+1}(s|t) w_t(s|t) \bar{C}_t(s|t) \bar{G}_{t+1}(s|t) \bar{G}_t(s|t)}{\sum_{s \neq t} \bar{T}_{t+1}(s|t) \bar{s}_t(s|t) \bar{C}_t(s|t) \bar{G}_{t+1}(s|t) \bar{G}_t(s|t)} \frac{1}{\theta}$$

$$\sum_{s \neq t} \bar{T}_{t+1}(s|t) \bar{s}_t(s|t) \bar{C}_t(s|t) \bar{G}_{t+1}(s|t) \bar{G}_t(s|t)$$

$$\Rightarrow 1 + p_{st+1} = 1 + \sum_{s \neq t} \pi_{st+1} (c_{st+1} | st) / c_{st+1} (c_{st+1}).$$

$$= 1 + \bar{\pi}_t p_{st+1} \Rightarrow p_{st+1} = \bar{\pi}_t p_{st+1} = \bar{\pi}_t (p_{st+1} + \delta y_{st+1}).$$

this is because we can approximate:

$$\frac{\sum_{s \neq t} \pi_{st+1} (c_{st+1} | st) (1 + \mu (c_{st+1} - c_t) + \delta p_{st+1} + \delta y_{st+1})}{\sum_{s \neq t} \pi_{st+1} (c_{st+1} | st) (1 + \mu (c_{st+1} - c_t) + \delta p_{st+1} + \delta y_{st+1})}.$$

$$\approx (1 + \sum_{s \neq t} \pi_{st+1} (c_{st+1} | st) (1 + \mu (c_{st+1} - c_t) + \delta p_{st+1} + \delta y_{st+1})) .$$

$$(1 - \sum_{s \neq t} \pi_{st+1} (c_{st+1} | st) (1 + \mu (c_{st+1} - c_t) + \delta p_{st+1} + \delta y_{st+1})) .$$

$$\approx 1 + \sum_{s \neq t} \pi_{st+1} (c_{st+1} | st) c_{st+1} (c_{st+1}) . \quad (4).$$

and (4) is already obtained when proving $c_0 = b_0 = y_0$

According to the description in Appendix 5.A. The economic system can be written as follows:

Firms :

$$\begin{aligned} \text{Final: } & \max_{y(i, s^t)} p(s^t) y(i, s^t) - \int_0^\infty p_t(i, s^t) d\tau - \int_0^\infty p_s(i, s^{t-1}) y(i, s^t) d\tau \\ \text{s.t. } & y(i, s^t) = \left[\int_0^\infty y(i, s^t) d\tau \right]^{\frac{1}{1-\theta}} \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} \text{Flexible: } & \max_{p_f(i, s^{t-1})} [p_f(i, s^t) - w(s^t)] y^d(i, s^t) \\ \text{s.t. } & y(i, s^t) \leq \lambda(i, s^t) \\ & y^d(i, s^t) = [p(s^t)/p(i)]^{\frac{1}{1-\theta}} y(s^t) \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} \text{Sticky: } & \max_{p_s(i, s^{t-1})} p_s(i, s^t) \sum_{s^t} q(s^t | s^{t-1}) y^d(i, s^t) - \sum_{s^t} \alpha(s^t | s^{t-1}) w(s^t) p(s^t) \\ \text{s.t. } & y(i, s^t) \leq \lambda(i, s^t) \\ & y^d(i, s^t) = [p(s^t)/p(i)]^{\frac{1}{1-\theta}} y(s^t) \end{aligned}$$

Consumer : $\max_{c(s^t), l(s^t)} \sum_{t=0}^{\infty} \sum_{s^t} \beta^t g(s^t) U(c(s^t), l(s^t))$

$$\begin{aligned} \text{s.t. } & p(s^t) c(s^t) = M(s^t) \\ & M(s^t) + \frac{B(s^t)}{R(s^t)} = R_p(s^{t-1})(1+\tau_\alpha) W(s^{t-1}) \\ & + (1-\tau(s^{t-1})) B(s^{t-1}) + T(s^t) + \pi(s^t) \end{aligned}$$

$$B(s^{t+1}) \geq \bar{B}$$

From above, we can get the following :

(Flexible) : $p_f(i, s^t) = \bar{w}(s^t)$

$$\text{(Sticky): } p_s(i, s^{t-1}) = \frac{1}{\theta} \frac{\sum_{s^t} q(s^t | s^{t-1}) p(s^t)^{\frac{1}{1-\theta}} w(s^t) y(s^t)}{\sum_{s^t} q(s^t | s^{t-1}) p(s^t)^{\frac{1}{1-\theta}} y(s^t)} \quad \textcircled{2}$$

$$\text{(Final): } p(s^t) = \left[\int_0^\infty p_t(i, s^t) \frac{\partial}{\partial i} d\tau + \int_0^\infty p_s(i, s^{t-1}) \frac{\partial}{\partial i} d\tau \right]^{\frac{1}{1-\theta}} \quad \textcircled{3}$$

$$\text{(Consumer): } \frac{1}{R(s^t)} = \sum_{s^{t+1}} q(s^{t+1} | s^t) \quad \textcircled{4}$$

$$Q(S^{t+1}|S^t) = \beta g(S^{t+1}|S^t) \frac{U_c(S^{t+1}) P(S^t)}{U_c(S^t) P(S^{t+1})} \quad \textcircled{5}$$

$$\frac{U_c(S^t)}{U_c(S^{t+1})} = \frac{(1-\gamma_c)W(S^t)}{P(S^t)} \quad \textcircled{6}$$

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{1}{R(S^t)} &= [(1-\gamma_c)] \sum_{S^{t+1}} P(S^{t+1}|S^t) \frac{U_c(S^{t+1}) P(S^t)}{U_c(S^t) P(S^{t+1})} \quad \textcircled{7} \\ &= (1-\gamma_c(S^t)) \frac{1}{R(S^t)} = (1-\gamma_c(S^t)) \sum_{S^{t+1}} Q(S^{t+1}|S^t) \end{aligned}$$

Therefore, competitive equilibrium is characterized by $\textcircled{6} \sim \textcircled{7}$,
More specifically:

By $\textcircled{6}$, $\textcircled{7}$ becomes:

$$P_f(i|S^t) = \frac{-1}{\theta} \cdot \frac{U_c(S^t)}{U_c(S^t)} \cdot \frac{P(S^t)}{(1+\gamma_c)} \quad \textcircled{8}$$

$\textcircled{8}$ becomes:

$$P_{Sc}(i, S^t) = -\frac{1}{\theta} \frac{\sum_i Q(S^t|S^{t-1}) P(S^t)^{\frac{1-\theta}{\theta}} \cdot \frac{1}{1+\gamma_c} \cdot Y(S^t)}{\sum_i Q(S^t|S^{t-1}) P(S^t)^{\frac{1-\theta}{\theta}} Y(S^t)} \quad \textcircled{9}$$

Substitute $\textcircled{8}, \textcircled{9}$ into $\textcircled{5}$

$$\begin{aligned} P(S^t)^{\frac{\theta}{\theta-1}} &= \alpha \left(-\frac{1}{\theta} \frac{U_c(S^t)}{U_c(S^t)} \cdot \frac{P(S^t)}{1+\gamma_c} \right)^{\frac{\theta}{\theta-1}} \\ &\quad + (1-\alpha) \left(-\frac{1}{\theta} \frac{\sum_i Q(S^t|S^{t-1}) P(S^t)^{\frac{1-\theta}{\theta}} \cdot \frac{1}{1+\gamma_c} \cdot Y(S^t)}{\sum_i Q(S^t|S^{t-1}) P(S^t)^{\frac{1-\theta}{\theta}} Y(S^t)} \right)^{\frac{\theta}{\theta-1}} \quad \textcircled{10} \end{aligned}$$

Then, competitive equilibrium is characterized by $\textcircled{6} \sim \textcircled{10}$. $\textcircled{10}$.

Though the paper, we know that Proposition 2 tells us that under the restricted policy of interest rate, the economy has a continuum of competitive equilibria.

Based on the same logic, we can propose a similar proposition under nonlinear economy:

Proposition: Under the restricted policy (linear feedback) of interest rate, for every feedback rule the economy has a continuum of competitive equilibria.

In order to prove it, we need to show that under the specific rule of interest rate, there exist multiple solutions satisfying $\textcircled{6} \sim \textcircled{10}$. Here's how we find out the solutions:

First, after the government observes the average sticky price, it makes the interest rate policy at period $t: i(S^{t-1})$ and it is observed by the flexible producers and the consumers. Let $R(S^t) = i(S^{t-1})$,

then, by $\textcircled{7}$, we can find the feasible set of $Q(S^{t+1}|S^t)$ s.t. $\{(Q(S^{t+1}|S^t))_{\text{shocks } \epsilon/R^n} | \sum_{\text{shocks } \epsilon/R^n} Q(S^{t+1}|S^t) = \frac{i(S^t)(1-\alpha(S^t))}{1-(\alpha(S^{t+1})|S^t)}\}$. This feasible set depends on the interest rate policy and the current period shocks. Also, it's not empty and not singleton.

Meanwhile, the consumer's decision on current & future consumption can be determined by $\textcircled{7}$, depending on current shock $\mathcal{T}(S^t)$, interest rate $i(S^{t-1})$ and current price level. The current average price and flexible price and be determined by $\textcircled{10}$ and $\textcircled{8}$.

In this sense, consumption, flexible price and average price in current period can be determined via the combination of ⑦ ~ ⑩

Also current output can be determined through the relation that $y(i, s^t) \leq l(i, s^t)$, if $l(i, s^t) \leq l(s^t)$ and,

$$y(i, s^t) = [\int y(i, s^{t'}) d s^{t'}]^{1/\theta}$$

- Since these decisions are all made after shocks, then current shock $\tau(s^t)$ is embedded in all of them.

At period $t+1$, since $p_s(i, s^{t+1})$ depends on $Q(s^{t+1}, s^t)$ which is determined in period t . Since $Q(s^{t+1}, s^t)$ has the shock in last period, i.e. $\tau(s^t)$, influencing its value, then $p_s(i, s^{t+1})$ also has $\tau(s^t)$, influencing its value

In all, at period t sticky producers base their price decisions on $v(s^{t-1})$ and $\tau(s^{t-1})$, i.e. interest rate policy and the shock in last period. Consumer bases its decision on the average price observed and current shock $\tau(s^t)$. Flexible producers based their decision on $\tau(s^t)$ and consumer's current preferences. That is, through ⑥ ~ ⑩ we can find at least one solution exist.

As we show previously, at the period t the feasible set of $Q(s^t, s^t)$ is not a singleton. Based on this and ⑨, we can find that a group of $p_s(i, s^t)$ can be obtained accordingly. Since $p_s(i, s^t)$ influence $p(s^t)$ and thereby consumption decisions for consumers, we may find corresponding $p(s^t), p_f(s^t), c(s^t), l(s^t)$ with respect to each of $p_s(i, s^t)$. Therefore, there is more than one equilibrium

HW 6 Problem 5.

(a) Define τ_1, τ_2 is the tax rate on labor income, define s_i as the depaute coefficient on government bond in period i . Given the tax rate, a competitive equilibrium for this economy is given by $\{c_1^H, \bar{g}_1^H, \bar{b}_1^H\}$ and a consumer allocation $\{c_1, \bar{g}_1, \bar{b}_1, \bar{s}_1\}$ and a allocation for government $\{\bar{B}_1, \bar{g}_1, \bar{y}_1\}$

and a firm allocation $\{\bar{g}_2, \bar{b}_2\}$, on price system $\{\bar{g}_2, \bar{w}_1, \bar{w}_2, \bar{y}\}$

1) Given τ_1, τ_2, s_2 and $\{\bar{g}_2, \bar{w}\}$, consumers choose $\{z_1^H\}$ to solve

$$\max \log(1 - z_1) + \beta \log(\bar{z}_1 + \delta \log(1 - z_1))$$

$$\text{s.t. } c_1 + \bar{g}_2 b_2^d = (1 - z_1) \bar{w}_1 + \bar{b}_2,$$

$$c_2 \leq (1 - z_2) \bar{w}_2 + (1 - \delta) b_2^d$$

2) Given $\{\bar{g}_2, \bar{w}, \bar{w}_1\}$, the firm choose $\{\bar{g}_1^H, \bar{b}_1^H\}$ to solve

$$\max \bar{g}_1^H + \bar{w}_1 b_1^H$$

$$\text{s.t. } c_1 + g_2 = A \bar{w}_1 \quad i=1, 2 \dots$$

which implies $\bar{w}_1 = \bar{w}_2 = A$

3) Government B.C.

$$\tau_1 \bar{w}_1 + \bar{g}_2 b_2 = \bar{g}_1$$

$$\tau_2 \bar{w}_2 = \bar{g}_2 + (1 - \delta) b_2$$

4) Market clearing:

$$\begin{cases} c_1 + g_2 = A \bar{w}_1 & \text{for } i=1, 2 \\ b_2^d = 1 \\ \bar{b}_2 = b \end{cases}$$

$$\bar{w}_1 = 1 + \tau_1, \quad \bar{w}_2 = 1 + \tau_2$$

(b) For government's policy $\pi = (\tau_1, \tau_2, \delta)$, define T as a allocation rule. Then a ~~pure~~

equilibrium is such that

i) Given any π , the allocation rule $T(\pi)$, solves the the problem

$$\max \log(1-\tau_1(1-\pi)) + \beta C \log \pi + \delta \log(1-\tau_2(1-\pi))$$

$$\text{s.t. } C + \beta b \leq C(1-\tau_1(1-\pi)) + \delta b$$

$$C_2 \leq (1-\tau_2'(1-\pi))b + (1-\delta')b$$

ii) the policy π maximizes the utility of consumption given a budget constraint

$$\max \log(C\pi) + \delta \log(1-C\pi) + \beta C \log \pi + \delta \log(1-\pi)$$

$$\text{s.t. } g_1 \leq \tau_1 A(1-\pi)$$

$$(1-\delta) b \leq \tau_2 A(1-\pi)$$

(c) Assume there are a large number of small private agents.

Define history and allocation rule and strategy:

Given $h_0 = \emptyset$, government chooses $\tau_1 = \tau_1(\emptyset)$, $g = g(\emptyset)$

Let $h_1 = \text{cho}, \tau_1, g$, agent chooses $c_1 = c_1(\text{cho}), \delta_1 = \delta_1(\text{cho}), b = b(\text{cho})$

Let $h_2 = \text{cho}, c_1, L_1(B)$, government chooses $\tau_2 = \tau_2(\text{cho}), g = g(\text{cho})$

Let $h_3 = (\text{cho}, \tau_2, g)$, agent chooses $c_2 = c_2(\text{cho}), \delta_2 = \delta_2(\text{cho})$

Let $G = (\text{cho}, \tau_1, \tau_2, g)$, $\tau_i(h_i) = \tau_i(c_i, \delta_i)$, $b_i = b_i(c_i, \delta_i)$

(G, f) is a sustainable equil. bmmn of
 (1) Given τ_1 & τ_2 , c_1, δ_1, τ_2, g solve
 $\max_{\{c_1, \delta_1\}}$

$$\log(G(\text{cho}, \tau_1, g)) + \alpha \log(1 - L_1(h_1, \tau_1, g)) \\ + \beta L_1 \log(G_2(h_2, \tau_2, g)) + \delta \log(1 - L_2(h_2, \tau_2, g)).$$

$$\text{s.t. } g \leq \tau_1 A L_1(c_1, \delta_1, g) + \tau_1 B(c_1).$$

$$(1 - \delta_1) B(c_1) \leq \tau_1 A L_2(h_1, \tau_2, g)$$

(2) Given $\tau_1 h_1$, $\tau_2(h_2)$, c_1, δ_1 solve

$$\max_{\{c_2, \delta_2\}} \log(C_1 + \delta \log L_1) + \beta L_1 \log G_2(h_2, \tau_2, g) + \delta \log(1 - L_2(h_2, \tau_2, g)).$$

(3) Given $\tau_1 h_1$, $c_1, \delta_1, b_1, \tau_2(h_2)$, c_2, δ_2 solves

$$\max_{\substack{c_1, \delta_1 \\ c_2, \delta_2}} \log(C_1 + \delta \log L_1) + \beta L_1 \log G_2(c_2, \delta_2, g) + \delta \log(1 - L_2(c_2, \delta_2, g)).$$

$$\text{s.t. } c_1 + \delta b_1 \leq \tau_1 - \tau_1 A \delta_1, \quad (f_1) \\ c_2 \leq (1 - g(\text{cho}, c_1, \delta_1, b_1)) b + (1 - \tau_2(h_2, c_2, \delta_2, b_2)) A \delta_2, \quad (f_2).$$

(P2)

Given $\forall h_3$, check which some:

$$\max \log(C_1 + \delta(1-\mu_1)) + \beta \log(C_2) + \log(1-\mu_1)$$

only

$$\text{so, } C_2 \leq (1-\delta)B + (1-\mu_2)A\ell_2. \quad (1)$$

characterize the outcome.

First consider problem (P2).

$$\begin{aligned} \text{The solution is: } & \frac{1}{C_2} = 1 \Rightarrow \frac{\alpha C_2}{1-\ell_2} = (1-\mu_2)A. \\ & \frac{1-\mu_2}{1-\ell_2} = (1-\mu_2)A \\ \Rightarrow C_2 = & \frac{(1-\mu_2)A}{\alpha} \quad \Rightarrow \quad \ell_2 = \frac{1}{1+\alpha} \left[\frac{(1-\mu_2)A - (1-\delta)B}{(1-\mu_2)A} \right] \\ \Rightarrow C_2 = & \frac{(1-\mu_2)A + (1-\delta)B}{1+\alpha} = C_2(h_3). \end{aligned}$$

Then consider problem (P1).

$$\begin{aligned} \text{the solution is: } & \frac{\alpha C_1}{1-\ell_1} = (1-\mu_1)A; \quad \frac{1}{C_1} = \mu_1, \quad \frac{\alpha}{1-\ell_1} = (1-\mu_1)A\ell_1. \\ \mu_1, \eta & \in (1-\delta)(h_1, C_1, \ell_1, B), \mu_2; \quad \frac{\ell_2}{C_2} = \mu_2, \quad \frac{\alpha B}{1-\ell_2} = \mu_2((1-\delta)(h_1, C_1, B), \ell_2) \\ \Rightarrow C_1 = C_1(h_1) = & \frac{A(1-\mu_1) + \eta b(h_1)}{1+\alpha} \\ \ell_1 = \ell_1(h_1) = & \frac{A(1-\mu_1) + \eta b(h_1)}{(1+\alpha)A(1-\mu_1)}. \end{aligned}$$

Now consider problem (6.2)

The solution is:

$$\begin{aligned} \text{Give } L_2(h_1, z_1, \delta) &= c_2(h_1, z_1, \delta) = \frac{(1-z_1)A + (1-\delta)B}{1+\alpha} \\ L_2(h_1, z_1, \delta) &= \delta c_1(h_1, z_1, \delta) = \frac{\delta}{1+\alpha} \left[\frac{(z_1 A - (1-\delta)B)}{(1-z_1)A} \right]. \end{aligned}$$

$$\Rightarrow \log(C_2(h_1, z_1, \delta)) + \delta \log(1-L_2(h_1, z_1, \delta))$$

$$= \log \left[\frac{(1-z_1)A + (1-\delta)B}{1+\alpha} \right] + \delta \log \left(1 - \frac{1}{1+\alpha} + \frac{(1-\delta)B}{(1-z_1)A} \frac{\delta}{1+\alpha} \right).$$

$$= \log [(1-z_1)A + (1-\delta)B] + \delta \log \left(1 + \frac{(1-\delta)B}{(1-z_1)A} \right) + \delta \log \frac{\delta}{1+\alpha} - \log(1+\alpha)$$

Now concentrate on government issues nonnegative debt.

$$\Rightarrow (1-\delta) B \cancel{+} z_1 A L_2(h_1, z_1, \delta)$$

$$\Rightarrow \log((1-\delta) B \cancel{+} z_1 A L_2(h_1, z_1, \delta))$$

$$= \cancel{\log z_1 A} + \cancel{z_1 A} \frac{\partial}{\partial z_1} (1 - \frac{1-\delta}{1+z_1})$$

$$\Rightarrow L_2(h_1, z_1, \delta) = \frac{1}{1+\alpha} \left(1 - \frac{\partial}{(1-z_1)A} \bullet z_1 A L_2(h_1, z_1, \delta) \right).$$

$$\Rightarrow \left[1 + \frac{\partial z_1}{(1+\alpha)(1-z_1)} \right] L_2(h_1, z_1, \delta) = \frac{1}{1+\alpha}.$$

$$\Rightarrow L_2(h_1, z_1, \delta) = \frac{1}{(1+\alpha) + \frac{\partial z_1}{1-z_1}} = \frac{(1-\delta)B}{(1+\alpha) + \frac{\partial z_1}{1-z_1}} = \frac{z_1 A}{(1+\alpha) + \frac{\partial z_1}{1-z_1}}$$

$$\Rightarrow \text{objective function} = \log L_2(h_1, z_1, \delta) + \frac{z_1 A}{(1+\alpha) + \frac{\partial z_1}{1-z_1}}$$

$$= \log A - \log \left(1 + \frac{(1-\delta)B}{(1+\alpha)(1-z_1) + z_1 A} \right) + \delta \log \frac{\delta}{1+\alpha} - \log(1+\alpha) - \log z_1 - \log(1-\delta).$$

$$\Rightarrow \text{objective function} = \log A + \log(1-z_1) + \frac{\alpha(1-z_2)}{1+\alpha - z_2} + \alpha \log \frac{1+\alpha}{1+\alpha - z_2}.$$

$$= \log(1-z_2) + \log(1+\alpha) - \log(1+\alpha - z_2)(1+\alpha) + \kappa.$$

$$\Rightarrow \frac{\partial f}{\partial z_2} = \frac{1}{1-z_2}(1) + \frac{1+\alpha}{1+\alpha - z_2} = \frac{1}{1-\frac{z_2}{1+\alpha}} - \frac{1}{1-z_2} < 0$$

$$\Rightarrow z_2^* = 0 \text{ and } s^* = 1.$$

Given, this we have, $B(h_1) = 0 = b(h_1)$.

$$\Rightarrow C_1^* = \frac{\theta}{A L_1(h_0, z_1, \eta)} = \frac{\theta}{A \frac{1}{1+\alpha}} = \frac{\theta(1+\alpha)}{A}$$

$$\Rightarrow C_2^*(h_1) = \frac{A(1-z_1^*)}{1+\alpha} = \frac{A(1-\frac{\theta(1+\alpha)}{A})}{1+\alpha} = \frac{A-\theta(1+\alpha)}{1+\alpha}$$

$$D_2^*(h_1) = \frac{A(1-z_1^*)}{(1+\alpha) A(1-z_1^*)} = \frac{1}{1+\alpha}$$

$$G_2^*(h_3) = \frac{(1-z_2^*)A}{1+\alpha} = \frac{A}{1+\alpha}, \quad D_2^*(h_3) = \frac{1}{1+\alpha}$$

\Rightarrow summary

$$C_1^*(h_1) = \frac{A-\theta(1+\alpha)}{1+\alpha}, \quad D_1^*(h_1) = \frac{1}{1+\alpha}, \quad C_2^*(h_3) = \frac{A}{1+\alpha}, \quad D_2^*(h_3) = \frac{1}{1+\alpha}$$

$$C_1^*(h_0) = \frac{\theta(1+\alpha)}{A}, \quad D_1^*(h_1) = 0, \quad S^*(h_1) = 1.$$